Getting Comfortable with Risk

September 2016
ARF Distribution

- 2015 reduced to 4% if over 61 and under age 70 and funds <€2M; 5% over age 70; 6% if funds >€2M.

- Deposit rates 2010/11 – 4/5% AER 5 year fixed term; 2016 0.4/0.5% AER 5 year fixed term.

- Many don’t require income distribution
Risk of ARF “Bomb-out” if funds left in cash

Assume: Annual Drawdown 4% p.a.; Increase in Drawdown 2% p.a.; Inflation 3% p.a.; Initial ARF €1M.
Source: Harvest Financial Services Ltd 14/09/2016
EII Scheme

- Look at investment of after tax income as tax efficiently as possible, e.g. EII Scheme
- What is the Employment and Investment Incentive Scheme (EIIS)?
- Up to 40% tax relief available against all income
- Harvest’s approach to EIIS
- Different levels of risk
Why is Risk Important?

• Growth cannot happen without Risk
• Along with Time and Diversification, Risk is the third leg of the Investment stool
• Accept Market Fluctuations
Cash Fund vs. Equity Fund

A - Aviva - International Equity Pn GTR in EU [109.93%]
B - Aviva - Cash Series E Pn GTR in EU [-24.37%]

07/09/2003 - 08/09/2018 Data from FE 2018
FTSE 100 over 30 years

A - FTSE 100 TR in GB [1453.80%]

31/1/1985 - 07/09/2016 Data from FE 2016
### Seven Year Asset Class Forecasts

**Average Annual Growth Rates**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset Class</th>
<th>Nominal</th>
<th>Real</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cash (US/UK/Euro)</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>-0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bonds (US/UK/Euro)</td>
<td>-0.7%</td>
<td>-2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Equities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- US</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Europe</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Emerging Markets</td>
<td>11.2%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Schroders 2016
“Avoid trying to predict the markets. Remember We have two classes of forecasters: Those who don't know ... and those who don't know they don't know”

J K Galbraith
Five Investment Pillars

- Time Horizon
- Asset Allocation/Diversification
- Differentiate between Cyclical and Permanent Losses
- 80:20 Rule
- Income
1. Time Horizon

- Exposure to Risk Assets (Equities, Property) requires a time horizon of five years minimum
- This allows for market cycles to run their course
And We All have More Time than we Think ...

Centenarians in Ireland

Source: Human Mortality database (HMD)
2. Asset Allocation and Diversification

- Important to achieve appropriate balance between the major asset classes
- Market timing is a very difficult thing to get right so at times of uncertainty phased investment is advisable
Balanced Asset Allocation

Portfolio Split

- Cash 14%
- Absolute Return 11%
- Private Equity 4%
- Commodities 21%
- Property 21%
- Bonds 5%
- Equities 43%
3. Cyclical and Permanent Losses

Portfolio Losses

Cyclical
- Diversified Equities
- Ungeared Property

Permanent
- Single Stocks
- Geared Property
- Debt of any Kind
- Private Equity
4. Follow the 80:20 Rule

- Ensure at least 80% of your portfolio is diversified, liquid and does not involve gearing

- The corollary is that a maximum of 20% of the portfolio should run the risk of permanent loss
5. Income

- Build in an income focus to a portion of your portfolio
- Income a real measure of value
- Compensation during volatile times
- Currently not difficult to beat Income from cash
‘The biggest risk is not taking any risk. The only strategy that is guaranteed to fail is not taking any risks.’

Mark Zuckerberg
The information contained herein is based on Harvest Financial Services Limited's understanding of current Revenue practice as at May 2016 and may change in the future.

This information has been provided for discussion purposes only. It is not advice, it is provided for general information purposes only and does not fully take into account your financial position, investment needs and objectives, attitude to risk, liquidity needs, etc. It should therefore not be relied upon to make investment decisions.

The value of your investment may go down as well as up.

Harvest Financial Services Limited is regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland.
CheckRisk

Simplifying the Complexity of Investment Risk

Harvest ARF Seminar

Nick Bullman
Chairman, CheckRisk

September 2016
Advances in risk knowledge and how behavioural finance can help.
A tale in three parts...

First part:

• What is risk?
• Does what we think matter? Sensation seeking and risk...
• Why is risk important?
• What are the current systems for looking at risk?
The future of risk ...

Second part: Risk in reality

1. Forward Looking Risk Models.

2. Network Risk Models

3. Causality, Cascades & Stress Testing

4. Nowcasts

5. Early Warning Risk System
Third part: The State of Financial Risk Today

Applying what we have learned...

1. Breaking Unconventional Monetary Policy (B.U.M.P)

2. Associated Risks

3. The period 2017-2020 a crisis in the making.
What is risk?
What is risk?

• The possibility that something unpleasant or unwelcome will happen? The possibility of financial loss?

• Is risk just a negative?

• Is risk uncertainty? A risk is not uncertainty. (Uncertainty is where neither the probability nor the mode of occurrence is known.)
What is risk?

- Risk is the potential to miss one’s target
- Risk is the probability of loss multiplied by the potential loss
- Risk is the potential that a chosen action or activity (including the choice of inaction) will lead to a loss or a missed opportunity
- Risk is a sensation we feel when outside our personal comfort zone. (Personal perception)
How come your bairn is albe to unernersnad tihs snetnece eevn tghouh olny the frist and lsat ltetres of ecah wrod are crreoct?
Risk Analysis Behavioural Considerations

- Decisions tend to be based on the latest information (Recency Bias)

- We tend to be less sceptical if we are enjoying something (Reward)

- We use pattern recognition to make decision making easier even if the outcome is less optimal than applying logic.
The nature of bubbles

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Risk Clusters

Source: CheckRisk LLP
What is a heuristic?

Heuristics refer to experience-based techniques for problem solving, learning, and discovery.

IN OTHER WORDS LEARNT BEHAVIOURS
**Example Heuristics**

**Affect:** The affect heuristic concerns “goodness” and “badness”. Affective responses to a stimulus occur rapidly and automatically.

**Anchoring:** A bias used by clever sales people to tether expectations to an unrealistic price.

**Availability:** Availability is a cognitive heuristic in which a decision maker relies upon knowledge that is readily available rather than examine other alternatives or procedures. (pattern recognition)

**Similarity:** “Like causes like” and “appearance equals reality”

**Over confidence:** A heuristic based on our inability to calculate probability

**Recency Bias:** The most recent information has the most influence

**Herding:** If everyone else is doing it, it must be right.
Example Heuristics

DO GROUPS MAKE BETTER RISK DECISIONS?

GROUP RISKY SHIFT
ANA Flight 60... Group risky Shift?
The historical model... Value at Risk

The Problem with VaR, Modified VaR, and Extreme VaR

S&P Daily Return Data from January 1928 to October 2010

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td>0.026%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sample number</strong></td>
<td>20,788</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Standard Deviation (σ)</strong></td>
<td>1.195%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kurtosis</strong></td>
<td>17.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skewness</strong></td>
<td>-0.095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Max Daily Return</strong></td>
<td>16.61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Min Daily Return</strong></td>
<td>-20.47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: CheckRisk LLP*
## Problems with VaR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th># of Standard Deviations from the Mean</th>
<th>Daily Return Range</th>
<th>Normal Distribution</th>
<th>ACTUAL Distribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>+6σ or more</td>
<td>Above +7.17%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+5σ</td>
<td>5.97% to +7.17%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+4σ</td>
<td>+4.78% to +5.97%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+3σ</td>
<td>+3.58% to +4.78%</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+2σ</td>
<td>+2.39% to +3.58%</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+1σ</td>
<td>+1.19% to +2.39%</td>
<td>2825</td>
<td>1502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0σ</td>
<td>-1.19% to +1.19%</td>
<td>14192</td>
<td>16907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-1σ</td>
<td>-1.19% to -2.39%</td>
<td>2825</td>
<td>1394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-2σ</td>
<td>-2.39% to -3.58%</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-3σ</td>
<td>-3.58% to -4.78%</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-4σ</td>
<td>-4.78% to -5.97%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-5σ</td>
<td>-5.97% to -7.17%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-6σ or more</td>
<td>Below -7.17%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Total                                 | ~                 | 20,788              | 20,788              | 100%

**Source:** CheckRisk LLP
Do Risk Clusters exist? Models say no...

The Market according to VaR

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Do Risk Clusters exist? Models say no...

Daily S&P 500 returns 1928-2011

Wall St crash & Great Depression
End of WW2
Black Monday
Tech bubble & crash
Credit Crunch

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Part 2
Risk in Reality
Tactical Risk
Strategic Risk
Network risk Modelling:

A network is comprised of nodes and edges.

Edge is the line that are the relationships that connect one node to another.

Can be theoretical or practical.

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Network risk Modelling:

CoVAR (conditional value at risk) (Brunnermeier 2011). This methodology tries to ascertain the probability of bank y defaulting, given bank x has already defaulted.

Size of node represents systemic importance of the bank to the network
Thickness of the line represents network interdependence
Network risk Modelling:

Size of node represents systemic importance of the bank to the network
Thickness of the line represents network interdependence
Granger causality is a statistical concept of causality that is based on prediction – the ability of $x$ to predict a future value of $y$. The hypothetical outcome is passed through various probability tests to determine the strength of the relationship at different time horizons, or whether there is any at all.
Grainger Causality Modelling:

5 Years

1 Year

Data to 1 April 2016

Arrow indicates direction of causation

Thickness of band is the strength of confidence interval. The thickest band is 99% confidence, middle band 95%, and thinnest band 90% confidence.

Granger, C. W. J. 1969 Investigating causal relations by econometric models and cross-spectral methods. Econometrica 37, 424-438

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Scenario Testing: Expected Short falls

Simulation Stress Factors at 95%

-9.00%
-8.00%
-7.00%
-6.00%
-5.00%
-4.00%
-3.00%
-2.00%
-1.00%
0.00%
1.00%
2.00%

Commodity
Chinese Equity
Emerging Market Equity
Eurozone Government Bonds
Japanese Equity
US Treasuries

3 Months ago 1 month Expected Shortfall forecast
1 month Expected Shortfall forecast

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Diebold Li model: Bond Term Structure

Euro Government Bond Term Structure
Forecasted Yield Curves on 29-Apr-2016 for 19-April-2018

Source: CheckRisk LLP
World GDP ‘Nowcast’ modelling

Source: CheckRisk LLP

Source: Antolin-Diaz, Dreschel, Petrella (2015) [1]
Black line: long-term trend
Dotted blue line: real-time estimate
Sold blue line: estimate using all data
Shaded areas: 68% and 90% confidence levels
[1] “Following the Trend: tracking GDP when long-run growth is uncertain”, CEPR Discussion Papers
Early Warning Risk Systems (EWRS)

• The methodology of our EWRS indicators weaves together both Macro-economic data and financial market data of mixed frequency (e.g. weekly, monthly etc.

• Able to deal with missing data, asymmetric start and end dates

• And clustering
Early Warning Risk Systems (EWRS)

Headline indicators contain between 90-120 sub-indices, with approximately 30-40 time-series in each category: risk, credit & leverage.

**Risk:** Contains many instruments, spreads and indices pertinent to signs of distress/risk aversion in the plumbing of the financial system, including preference for liquidity or diminished liquidity. These come from many different markets including: rates, repo, credit, equity, FX, options, swaps.

**Credit:** The ‘credit’ risk category not only refers to increasing credit provision, but also that of deteriorating credit quality in different parts of the financial system.

**Leverage:** The ‘leverage’ risk category aims to quantify by how much debt is building up in different parts of the financial system: from the central bank, the government; to companies, banks, financial institutions and households. Understanding how extended that has become and the rate of change in the signal readings is important as a leading indicator of GDP growth and financial stress.

Within each risk category evidently, there are some indicators which are more important than others – they are weighted accordingly. Due to the variation in data in both frequency and richness across regions, the underlying time series do vary from region to region.

*Source: CheckRisk LLP*
EWRS: CheckRisk European Financial Stress Indices

Source: CheckRisk LLP
What is this all for?

Part 3

B.U.M.P.
What is B.U.M.P?

Circle Colour = Risk Evaluation
Arrow Colour = Increase/Decrease Risk
Red: Increasing
Orange: Neutral
Green: Improving

Source: CheckRisk LLP
A little history: The scale and perspective

- $59tn since 2008
- 290% Debt to GDP
- Debt outgrows GDP for almost 5 decades
- Spread widest in history
- Still growing

Source: BIS, World Bank, CheckRisk LLP
How big is a trillion?

If you stack a trillion-worth of $1000 bills together, then:
1 million dollars = 4 inches high
1 billion dollars = 364 feet high
1 trillion dollars = 63 miles high (give a foot or two)

OR:

1 million seconds is about 11.5 days
1 billion seconds is about 32 years
1 trillion seconds is about 32,000 years

$1,000,000,000,000 = 10^{12}$
## Composition of Debt

Global stock of debt outstanding by type

$ trillion, constant 2013 exchange rates

### Compound annual growth rate (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>2000–07</th>
<th>2007–14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Household</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Haver Analytics, BIS, IMF, McKinsey Global Institute Analysis
What was the purpose of Quantitative Easing?

QE

• **Primary Purpose**
  - Inflation
  - GDP Growth

• **Secondary Purpose**
  - Bank stability
  - Buying Time
Has it worked & What is the problem?

Has it worked?
- Inflation remains well below target
- Global GDP growth is below target
- US growth is stalling

A Utopian Dream
- You cannot solve a debt problem with more debt
- Global economy is changing structurally
- Distortion of interest rates and funding practices
- Banks took the funds and placed them in commodity markets, and Emerging Markets
**Negative Interest Rate Policy N.I.R.P.**

- Central Banks are hooked on monetary easing
  - N.I.R.P is intended to stop Banks from depositing money at the central bank instead of lending to the economy.
  - An unintended consequence of N.I.R.P is to squeeze bank margins forcing them to raise interest rates on products like mortgages and general credit.
  - The result is an unforeseen tightening of credit. Precisely the opposite of what the Central Bank is intending.

- The risk of Central Bank Policy error increases with N.I.R.P

- Interest Rate Shock Risk versus No Normalisation
Negative Risk an oxymoron

- Fiat Value of Currency
- Cash has a 0% interest rate
- Any interest rate is therefore an expression of risk
- Negative interest rates imply negative risk
- Negative Risk is an oxymoron
Other sources of Risk: Economics

Circle Colour = Risk Evaluation
Arrow Colour = Increase/Decrease Risk
Red: Increasing
Orange: Neutral
Green: Improving
US Trend Growth slowing

CheckRisk Nowcast: US Real Time Estimate Underlying Economic Activity

Source: CheckRisk

Shaded areas: 68% and 90% confidence levels
No USA recession yet, but...

Another important measure to monitor in the months ahead is the US Fed Loan Officer Survey for Credit Tightening. It is one of the more important indicators in our ‘credit stress index’ for the US. The survey reports on banks tightening credit to commercial and industrial companies. If the survey continues to show tightening in the months ahead and reach the 20% level, then this would be a much stronger recessionary signal.
Other sources of Risk: Sync Risk

Circle Colour = Risk Evaluation
Arrow Colour = Increase/Decrease Risk
Red: Increasing
Orange: Neutral
Green: Improving

BUMP

Geopolitical Risk
Sync Risk
Central Bank Policy Error
Currency Wars
Global Economy & GDP

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Synchronisation Risk

- Federal Reserve tightens as rest of world eases
- Net impact reduced
- Unintended Consequences
- Don’t Synchronisation Risks always exist?
Other sources of Risk: Geopolitics

Circle Colour = Risk Evaluation
Arrow Colour = Increase/Decrease Risk
Red: Increasing
Orange: Neutral
Green: Improving

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Geopolitical Risk

Instability in:

- Middle East: Syria, Iran/Saudi Arabia, Algeria, Tunisia
- Europe (Immigration)
- Ukraine
- China and South China Sea
- Brexit
- US Elections
- Rise of Extreme Politics
NETWORKING OF B.U.M.P RISKS

Circle Colour = Risk Evaluation
Arrow Colour = Increase/Decrease Risk
Red: Increasing
Orange: Neutral
Green: Improving

Source: CheckRisk LLP
Why is 2017-2020 Risky?

The Perfect Storm?

Natural Economic Cycle peaks in the period 2017-2020 at a time when Central Banks have the least ammunition available. IMF forecasts recession in 2018

& The world is awash with debt...Need 350bps to 500bps interest rate buffer

• Central Bank Policy Errors are key
• Multiple global fault lines remain in the form of imbalances
• Geopolitical risks much higher than usual
• Regional monetary policy likely to remain divergent
• N.I.R.P will tighten credit
• Synchronisation risk is important at zero rate bound
• Middle East Instability
And one more thing:

- Bank capital is a fraction of World GDP
- World GDP is a fraction of the total derivatives outstanding
- Most of the derivatives must therefore be speculative
- Who delivers on them if Bank capital is insufficient?
- Total Gross Derivatives Exposure is $533 trillion, 7x Global GDP
The way out? THE GREAT ESCAPE

- GDP Growth

- Inflation

- Infrastructure Spending
  - THE NEXT CENTRAL BANK “THING” WILL BE BASED ON DIRECT INVESTMENT
  - HELICOPTER MONEY EXPLAINED
  - ROADS, BRIDGES, COMMUNICATION, AIRPORTS, FREIGHT TERMINALS, PORTS.

- Deficit Spending = More Debt = Kick the Can

- The Emperor has no clothes
When?

TIMING IS EVERYTHING...

All Depends on Central Bank Policy Actions in the next year
WE THINK A PERIOD OF INCREASED RISK IS COMING

THE TIME WINDOW IS QUITE WIDE

IT COULD BE LENGTHENED BY CENTRAL BANK POLICY & INTERVENTION

THE LIKELY OUTCOMES OF CURRENT POLICY ARE NARROWING

THE WARNING SIGNS ARE THERE IF YOU CARE TO LOOK FOR THEM

THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITIES AS A CONSEQUENCE OF THE NEXT CRISIS
What can you do?

Don’t be paralysed by risk. Risk is an opportunity.

Professional advisors are less likely to be emotional about risk decisions.

Think long term and ignore short term thinking.

Do not assume positive returns are always available in a NIRP environment.

Work harder at it.
Contact Details

1st Floor Offices
4 Miles’s Buildings
George Street
Bath BA1 2QS
United Kingdom
Ph: +44(0) 1225 422 583

Australia:
Denis Carroll
Director
Email: denis@check-risk.com
Ph: +61 414673539

Ireland:
John Cunningham
Director
Email: john@check-risk.com
Ph: +353 86 259 1022

Website: www.check-risk.com

Source of all market information is extracted from Bloomberg with exceptions of Harpex and the Bull / Bear ratio figures. Harpex data is collected from www.harperpeterson.com. Bull/Bear Ratios collected from www.investorsintelligence.com. This document is provided to you on a confidential basis for your information and discussion only. It is not a solicitation or an offer to buy or sell any security or other financial instrument. Any information including facts, opinions or quotations, may be condensed or summarised and is expressed as of the date of writing. The information may change without notice and CheckRisk LLP (“CheckRisk”) is under no obligation to ensure that such updates are brought to your attention. The price and value of investments mentioned and any income that might accrue could fall or rise or fluctuate. Past performance is not a guide to future performance. If an investment is denominated in a currency other than the base currency, changes in the rate of exchange may have an adverse effect on value, price or income. This document and any related recommendations or strategies may not be suitable for you; you should ensure that you fully understand the potential risks and rewards and independently determine that it is suitable for your given objectives, experience, financial resources and any other relevant circumstances. You should consult with such advisor(s) as you consider necessary to assist you in making these determinations. Nothing in this document constitutes investment, legal, accounting or tax advice, or a representation that any investment or strategy is suitable or appropriate to your individual circumstances, or otherwise constitutes a personal recommendation to you. This document may relate to investments or services of an entity/person outside the UK, or to other matters which are not regulated by the FCA, or in respect of which the protections of the FCA for retail clients and/or the UK Financial Services Compensation Scheme may not be available. Further details as to where this may be the case are available on request in respect to this document. Certain information contained herein has been obtained from third party sources. While such information is believed to be reliable for the purposes used herein, no representations are made to the accuracy or completeness thereof and CheckRisk takes no responsibility for such information. This document is intended only for the person to whom it is issued by CheckRisk. It may not be reproduced either in whole, or in part, without CheckRisk’s written permission. The distribution of this document and the offer and sale of the investment in certain jurisdictions may be forbidden or restricted by law or regulation. Investments may have no public market or only a restricted secondary market. Where a secondary market exists, it is not possible to predict the price at which investments will trade in the market or whether such market will be liquid or illiquid. As such investments will not be listed or traded on any exchange, pricing information may be more difficult to obtain and the liquidity of the investments may be adversely affected. A holder may be able to realise value prior to an investment’s maturity date only at a price in an available secondary market.